

BOARD OF EDUCATION
(Official)

January 14, 2015
Elizabeth, New Jersey

The regular meeting of the Board of Education was called on January 14, 2015 at 7:00 p.m., in the Multi Purpose Room, Donald Stewart Center for Early Childhood Education, 544 Pennsylvania Avenue, Elizabeth, New Jersey.

Board President Ana Maria Amin presented the following statement at 7:25 p.m.

“Ladies and Gentlemen, good evening. This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Board of Education. Pursuant to New Jersey Statutes and the rules adopted by the Board of Education, notice of this meeting was sent to Worrall Community Newspapers, The Star Ledger and Cablevision of Elizabeth on Monday, January 12, 2015. In addition, this notice is posted on the Bulletin Board in the lobby of 500 North Broad Street, and pursuant to this act, a copy has been filed with the City Clerk of Elizabeth.”

“I wish to extend a warm welcome to everyone present and to our television viewers to this January 14, 2015 meeting of the Board of Education. We are here to govern, provide management oversight, and make policy for the district. The Superintendent manages the district. This is a meeting of the Board in public, not a meeting of the public.”

“This meeting is being recorded and will become part of the Elizabeth Board of Education permanent record. In order that the recording will adequately reflect the proceedings, please refrain from talking while others are speaking. I also ask that you silence the sound on your electronic devices. Since it is legally mandated that these proceedings be accurately recorded, I may have to ask for order periodically should noise begin to interfere with our recording capabilities. I am pleased that you have taken time this evening to join us. Thank you for your interest in the Elizabeth Public Schools.”

“There will be a public portion for citizens to address the Board. Participants for the public portion must sign in one hour prior to the advertised start of the meeting so that they may have the opportunity to speak. The sign-in sheet states the name, address, telephone number and reason that the person wants to comment, whether it is an agenda item or a general education comment.”

Mr. Kennedy stated that he needs to read a letter that he just received today. Mr. Kennedy stated that it is for the record and is addressed to Mr. Kennedy, Business Administrator. Mr. Kennedy read the letter from Tony Monteiro stating that he was withdrawing his resignation from the Board of Education.

Board President Amin requested Steven Edelstein, Esq., Schwartz, Simon, Edelstein & Celso, LLC to explain to the community.

Steven Edelstein, Esq., Schwartz, Simon, Edelstein & Celso, LLC, stated that as many people may know from things that they have read in the public press a lawsuit was filed earlier this week by a citizen, Ms. Gallante. Mr. Edelstein stated that the lawsuit makes a number of allegations concerning the last two Board meetings but a centerpiece of the lawsuit is the contention that the special meeting of January 6, 2015 was improper and that everything that took place at that meeting is legally invalid and null and void. Mr. Edelstein stated that the lawsuit asks the court to declare that the actions taken at that meeting are null and void. Mr. Edelstein stated that the lawsuit is very well prepared by a very reputable law firm and very reputable lawyers. Mr. Edelstein stated that what the basic contention is in the first instance is that there was a flaw in the way that the public notice was given for that meeting and it then goes on to discuss events that occurred at the meeting. Mr. Edelstein stated that there is another aspect of the lawsuit that has to do with some events at the organization meeting as well. Mr. Edelstein stated that he was directed to prepare a response to that lawsuit and he did so and it was filed

earlier today and served on counsel. Mr. Edelstein stated that what the courts' decisions teach us when we represent public bodies is that when a claim is made that there has been an Open Public Meetings Act violation the public body should in the first instance evaluate whether there is a way to eliminate the controversy and whether there is a way to alleviate the problem. Mr. Edelstein stated that in fact there is a body of law that suggests that is something a judge might ask a public body to do even if there were a determination that there was a problem. Mr. Edelstein stated that in this instance he spoke, as the attorney handling the litigation, with the Board President, with Mr. Lehman, with Mr. Fajardo, and with Mr. Monteiro. Mr. Edelstein stated that the essential key allegation of the complaint as it relates to Mr. Monteiro appears in Paragraph 4 and says at the January 6th meeting the Board accepted Mr. Monteiro's resignation thus creating a vacancy on the Board. Mr. Edelstein stated that it goes on to complain about the way the vacancy was filled. Mr. Edelstein stated that after discussing this fully with the three gentlemen and Mrs. Amin, Board President, it was concluded by Mr. Monteiro, Mr. Fajardo, and Mrs. Amin that this was a divisive issue that was not worth fighting about and the Board would concede that the actions at the meeting were null and void. Mr. Edelstein stated that as the complaint alleged the Board accepted Mr. Monteiro's resignation thus creating a vacancy and if that action is null and void as if it never occurred there is not yet a vacancy. Mr. Edelstein stated that Mr. Monteiro has now withdrawn his resignation and he resumes his seat for the remainder of his term. Mr. Edelstein stated that means the appointment of Mr. Fajardo to fill that vacancy is also null and void. Mr. Edelstein stated that if there was no vacancy there was no seat to fill. Mr. Edelstein stated that is how we find ourselves with Mr. Monteiro sitting here.

Mrs. Amin thanked Mr. Edelstein for the explanation.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that Mr. Monteiro had resigned before the January 6th meeting and asked if that was correct.

Mr. Edelstein stated that he was not at the January 6th Board meeting but the resignation was apparently communicated before that meeting but was accepted by the Board at that meeting.

Mr. Rodriguez asked Mr. Kennedy if he received Mr. Monteiro's resignation before the January 6th meeting.

Mr. Kennedy stated that the afternoon of that meeting Mr. Monteiro spoke with Mr. Lehman and himself and indicated that he wished to resign and have the Board accept it at that night's meeting.

Mr. Rodriguez asked that since Mr. Monteiro is not an employee of the Board of Education do we have to accept his resignation for it to be binding.

Mr. Edelstein stated that he believes the answer is yes but he doesn't have to accept his word for it. Mr. Edelstein stated that the allegation in the verified complaint that he just read, filed by Mr. Corlett of the Decotiis Firm, alleges that the acceptance of the resignation creates the vacancy and he believes that is correct.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that since he is not an employee we don't actually have to accept his resignation for it to be binding.

Mr. Edelstein stated that he can withdraw the resignation up until the time that it is accepted.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that he is not an employee.

Mr. Edelstein stated that Mr. Rodriguez asked for his opinion and he gave it and he prefers not to argue with him about it.

Present: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Absent: None

Superintendent of Schools Olga Hugelmeyer, School Business Administrator/Board Secretary Harold E. Kennedy, Jr., Assistant Superintendent for Schools Rafael Cortes, Assistant Superintendent for Schools Linda Seniszyn, Interim Assistant Superintendent for Teaching and Learning Jennifer Cedeno, Assistant Board Secretary Donald Goncalves, Comptroller William Greene, Supervising General Counsel/Board Attorney Marvin Lehman, and members of the public were in attendance.

Mrs. Carvalho asked if Mr. Monteiro has to get re-sworn in.

Mr. Edelstein stated that he does not. Mr. Edelstein stated that he is simply continuing the term for which he was sworn and he is not starting a new term.

Mrs. Carvalho asked that since she is new at this will she be privy to receive a copy of the letter that he submitted to the Board.

Mr. Edelstein responded yes and asked if she was referring to the letter that Mr. Kennedy just read.

Mrs. Carvalho responded yes.

Board President Amin asked Dr. William A. Greene to give the invocation.

Colors were presented during the Flag Ceremony by members of the Admiral William F. Halsey, Jr. Leadership Academy Marine Corps Junior R.O.T.C.

Pledge of Allegiance
National Anthem
Pledge of Ethics

Mrs. Amin introduced a video presentation of the Core Beliefs and Commitments.

Mr. Trujillo proposed a resolution and asked for a copy to be distributed to each Board member. Mr. Trujillo read the resolution:

Be It Resolved as Follows:

1. The election of officers at the Organization Meeting of January 7, 2015 is hereby ratified and affirmed;
2. Item 7, Resolutions 2-10 of the original, unamended Organization meeting agenda are hereby approved; and
3. Any action taken at the Organization meeting which is inconsistent with this Resolution is hereby rescinded effective immediately;
4. The appointment of Robert Varady, Esq., as General Counsel, which took place without the recommendation of the Superintendent is hereby rescinded effective immediately.

Be It Further Resolved that all actions taken by the Board of Education at its meeting of January 6, 2015 are hereby ratified and affirmed, except for the acceptance of the resignation of Mr. Monteiro and appointment of Mr. Fajardo which are not ratified and reaffirmed and are now moot.

Resolution – Ratification and Affirmation

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, that the resolution be adopted.

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro (abstain – Mendonca & Partners, CPAs, LLC, ICA Risk Management Consultants), Perreira, Trujillo, Amin – 5

Negative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 4

Mr. Rodriguez asked if Mr. Edelstein is our general counsel at the moment.

Mr. Edelstein responded no. Mr. Edelstein stated that the reason he was asked to sit here is because he is representing the Board in a piece of litigation that affected the organization of the Board and it was apparent to the President that an explanation for some actions would be needed.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that at this point, no offense to him personally, he believes that he shouldn't be sitting at the dais with us.

Mr. Edelstein stated that it is entirely up to the President.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that with the things that are going on back and forth he knows that the judge will be hearing the case in terms of the complaint that Mr. Edelstein alluded to today and he believes the court case is on Friday. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he thinks it would be prudent to table the rest of the meeting until a court determines if what we did today was legal, lawful, or not. Mr. Rodriguez stated that we all know what happens sometimes when we listen to bad legal advice. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he knows an ex-member, Mr. Fajardo, had listened, well at least he said he had listened, to bad legal advice as he claims McCarter & English which cost him \$63,000. that he actually has to repay the district so we all know what can happen if we don't. Mr. Rodriguez stated that sometimes rushing through this, making a show for the public, for your Facebook pages just wouldn't be prudent. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he knows a lot of people came out tonight and it would be an inconvenience to them but he feels for the district, the students, and the employees that we perhaps should table this meeting, wait until we get a decision by the courts and then come back.

A motion was made by Mr. Rodriguez, seconded by Mr. Neron, to table the rest of the meeting.

The motion was defeated by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 4

Negative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Perreira, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 5

Board President Amin asked Mr. Kennedy to continue with the agenda.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the minutes of the meeting of December 11, 2014 be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Perreira, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 4

Abstain: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Mr. Monteiro – 3

Negative: Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 2

Secretary and Treasurer's Report for the Month of November 2014

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Perreira, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 5

Abstain: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 4

Negative: None

Personnel Report – Leaves of Absence, etc.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

Mr. Rodriguez congratulated the retirees for their years of service to the district and wished them a happy and healthy retirement. Mr. Rodriguez asked if there will be a replacement for a resource teacher who is being transferred.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer explained that following a thorough review of the master schedules done by the Director of Special Services that resource teacher was actually excess at Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy so we reallocated the position to Elizabeth High School.

Mr. Rodriguez questioned the number of hours and cost needed to plan for a parent seminar.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer explained that this is actually the registration period for high school that is part of the offering we do with extended hours during the week and on weekends.

The motion was carried by the following vote (except for the additional services for Shante Gilmore-Rorie which did not receive the required number of votes):

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Perreira (abstain – S.G.), Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 5

Abstain: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 4

Negative: None

Tuition Report

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Superintendent's Report – Considerations

A motion was made by Mr. Perreira, seconded by Mr. Rodriguez, that the requests be approved.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Superintendent's Report – Use of Facilities

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Neron, that the requests be approved as recommended except with a waiver of all fees for the request from Benedictine Academy.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that he has some questions on the request from Benedictine Academy on insurance and liability because it is a pool environment with a higher risk of something happening. Mr. Rodriguez asked if we were to waive fees would be more liable than if we charge fees.

Mr. Lehman stated that it would not have any effect on liability.

Mr. Kennedy stated that all of our users of facilities have to provide their proof of insurance with an insurance certificate.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Supplemental Superintendent's Report – Use of Facilities

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina that the requests be approved as recommended.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Superintendent's Report – Field Trips

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the requests be approved.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Superintendent's Report

Superintendent of Schools Olga Hugelmeier stated that her report includes highlights from InsideEPS beginning with the article *Former EHS Standout Bowles Named Jets Head Coach*. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools congratulates former Elizabeth High School football player Todd Bowles for being selected as the head coach of the New York Jets. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that long before his success as a professional football player and coach, Bowles honed his athletic skills in Elizabeth. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles was born in Elizabeth and lived in Elizabethport. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that growing up he participated in athletics at the George Washington School No. 1 community program. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles became a star safety for the EHS football team and graduated with the Class of 1981. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles went on to become a four-year starter as a defensive back at Temple University and in 1984 he earned first-team All-East honors as a junior. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that after a productive senior season Bowles was selected to participate in the 1985 Blue-Gray Game which served as a senior all-star game. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the Washington Redskins signed him as a free agent where he played for seven seasons and played one season with the San Francisco 49ers in 1991. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that one of the top highlights of Bowles' eight year career was starting at free safety for the 1988 Super Bowl Champion Washington Redskins who defeated the Denver Broncos in Super Bowl XXII 42-10. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that following a successful playing career Bowles joined the Green Bay Packers organization as a member of the team's player personnel staff in 1995. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that in 2001 he received his first professional coaching position from then front office executive Bill Parcells and served as defensive back coach of the New York Jets. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that after serving as defensive back coach for the Jets, Cleveland Browns, and Dallas Cowboys he was hired by the Dolphins as the team's secondary coach and assistant head coach in 2008. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles served the last three games of the 2011 season as the team's interim head coach posting a record of 2-1. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles coached the secondary for the Philadelphia Eagles in January 2012 and was named defensive coordinator later in the 2012 season. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that Bowles served as the defensive coordinator for the Arizona Cardinals the past two seasons before coming full circle to return home and rejoin the Jets organization as its new head coach.

Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the next article is *New Classrooms Wins \$3 Million Grant To Expand Personalized Learning in Elizabeth Public Schools*. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the U.S. Department of Education has awarded New Classrooms Innovation Partners a \$3 million Investing in Innovation (i3) grant to expand its successful personalized learning model in partnership with Elizabeth Public Schools. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that this grant will allow New Classrooms to implement its Teach to One: Math personalized instructional model in up to five additional district schools in Elizabeth and conduct a rigorous three-year study of its impact

with the Consortium for Policy Research in Education (CPRE) at Columbia University's Teachers College. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that New Classrooms is currently working in iPrep Academy in Elizabeth where Teach to One: Math leverages classroom design, teacher talent, and technology to enable personalized learning for every student every day. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that along with a second school implementation planned this year the five expansion schools made possible by the i3grant will mean 25% of Elizabeth's 27 K-8 schools will be implementing Teach to One: Math. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that in Teach to One: Math middle school students receive a combination of small group, large group, and individual math instruction that builds on the skills they mastered the previous day. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that according to an independent study released last month, the 6,000 students in 15 schools using Teach to One: Math nationally made on average 1.5 years of progress in math or 47% more than the national average and at iPrep Academy students on average made 1.7 years of progress or 70% more than the national average. Mrs. Hugelmeier quoted New Classrooms Co-Founder and CEO Joel Rose, "Elizabeth Public Schools has a bold vision that centers on personalized learning and we are excited to be part of it. By serving more students and rigorously evaluating ourselves, we intend to show there is another way of doing school that can vastly improve outcomes for students from all different backgrounds. We thank all of our partners and the U.S. Education Department for recognizing the importance of R&D in helping to modernize our school systems." Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that we are extremely fortunate that a strong collaborative partnership exists with New Classrooms and our work together has resulted in students at our iPrep Academy making significant gains across grade levels, racial groups, and student designations including English Language Learners and Special Education. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that federal funding will support 87% of the total costs of this project. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that in order to be eligible for the federal grant, New Classrooms is required to raise \$450,000. in matching funds or 15% of the government's total contribution. Mrs. Hugelmeier quoted Associate Professor of Education and Public Policy at Teachers College Douglas Ready, "The Consortium for Policy Research in Education at Teachers College, Columbia University, is delighted to be involved in the evaluation of Teach to One: Math in the Elizabeth, New Jersey Public Schools. We look forward to working with both New Classrooms Innovation Partners and students and staff in Elizabeth in this important effort to transform mathematics teaching and learning." Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that New Classrooms, Elizabeth, and CPRE were among just 26 winning applicants out of more than 430 that applied. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the organizations are in the process of selecting the schools and timeline for this expanded partnership.

Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the next article is *EHS Recommended To Submit Consideration for 2015 National Blue Ribbon Schools Federal Program*. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that based on state assessment data, Elizabeth High School has been nominated to apply for this award as an Exemplary High Performing School. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the U.S. Department of Education will be sending EHS a formal invite to apply for the program shortly. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the completed applications are very comprehensive and due to the USDOE by March 20, 2015 and successfully completing the national application round leads to the next hurdle which would require EHS to make Annual Measurable Objectives (AMO) for the 2014-2015 school year. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that if that is completed then EHS will be invited to attend the national awards ceremony in Washington, D.C. in November 2015 where schools around the country will celebrate their success, share information, and receive a plaque and flag to commemorate their achievement.

Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that we had the honor of attending the State Board of Education meeting at the beginning of January and the State of New Jersey hosted a recognition ceremony to formally present the Milken Educator Award to Tracy Espiritu. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that the State Board of Education also honored William F. Halloran School No. 22 as a National Blue Ribbon School and congratulated Principal Michael Webb. Mrs. Hugelmeier stated that this concludes the InsideEPS report.

Mrs. Amin thanked Superintendent Hugelmeier for her informative report.

Authorizations Report – Authorization to Make Application, etc.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, that the report be accepted.

Mr. Rodriguez thanked the Elizabeth Chapter of UNICO, LensCrafters, and Figli di San Gennaro for their donations.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Supplemental Authorizations Report – Authorization to Participate, etc.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Finance and Accounting Report – Authorization to Pay Vouchers

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that she would like to schedule a meeting with the Superintendent and Business Administrator so she could better understand how we are spending our money.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus (abstain- Schwartz Simon Edelstein & Celso, LLC), Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro (abstain- City of Elizabeth, Leaguers, Inc., New Jersey School Insurance Group, USA Architects, USBAFlex), Neron (abstain- Schwartz Simon Edelstein & Celso, LLC), Perreira, Rodriguez (abstain- Schwartz Simon Edelstein & Celso, LLC), Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Carvalho – 1

Negative: None

Ms. Bathelus asked if everything passed on the Finance and Accounting Report.

Mr. Kennedy responded yes.

Supplemental Finance and Accounting Report – Transfer of Funds

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Carvalho – 1

Negative: None

Award of Contracts Report

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, that the report be accepted.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that she would like to set up an appointment with the Superintendent and Business Administrator so she could go over the contracts for the bussing service so she could better understand why we are spending this money on busses.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that this year we had to cut a lot of bussing throughout the entire district and there are a lot of families suffering to the point where some people who can't make ends meet have to hire taxi service or private people to take their children to school. Mr. Rodriguez stated that there is a lot of money in these contracts. Mr. Rodriguez stated that in our agenda it says recommended by the Director of Transportation and it is the lowest responsible bidder, and it gives an amount and almost \$1 million in contracts. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he doesn't see the other bids. Mr. Rodriguez asked why the other bids were not included on this agenda.

Mr. Kennedy explained that the names were included but not the dollar amount. Mr. Kennedy stated that it shows who responded and it was awarded to the lowest responsible bidder.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that in the future he would ask in the sake of transparency for the public and for everyone that we put at least the lowest three bidders so that we could see who it is. Mr. Rodriguez stated that what he is afraid of is a lot of times if the bid spread of the next lowest is a substantial difference then there could be an issue. Mr. Rodriguez stated that in the future for contracts that are \$250,000. that we can put in the three lowest bidders for the sake of transparency. Mr. Rodriguez stated that as a Board member he would like to see the bid spread, what the difference is between the lowest and the second lowest, and is it close or is it really far apart because if it is really far apart it is something that we should look into why are they so different.

Mr. Trujillo stated that Mr. Rodriguez brought up a valid point and transparency is important and always has been for as long as he has been on this Board. Mr. Trujillo stated that this is not only the lowest but also the most responsible bidder meaning that these are the people that can actually get the job done.

Mr. Kennedy stated that is correct and it is not always the lowest bidder but a combination of are they able to provide the services also.

Mr. Trujillo stated that we can all understand a scenario where someone who wins the bid cannot actually provide the service and leaving us in the middle of a school year when the weather gets bad and not being able to provide the service to our children and perhaps leaving us stranded. Mr. Trujillo stated that in the past we have had issues with even some of the responsible services which are bigger companies and have more equipment and more experience and even with them issues arise. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is tough to say that we would give this to someone who is irresponsible simply because they are the cheapest.

Mr. Kennedy responded that is correct.

Mr. Trujillo stated that all bids are available upon review from the public if someone is interested in seeing them and they can contact the Business Office and provide the information.

Mr. Kennedy stated that is correct.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that as a Board member she can request that it be put on the agenda.

Mr. Kennedy stated that we can adjust the agenda.

Mrs. Carvalho requested that in the future it be put on the agenda so we know what is going on.

Mr. Kennedy stated that it is in accordance with 18A:18A which are the rules that the Purchasing Department follows so it would be risky to knowingly put up a bid that was not the lowest responsible bid. Mr. Kennedy stated that in the sake of transparency it is something that can be provided.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that as Board members we are stewards of the public's money and we are asked to vote on almost one million of tax dollars so he would appreciate for him and the public to know. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he is more concerned with the bid spreads to know if it is way off and why is it and to go from there.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus (abstain- Durham School Services, Shore Vans, Villani Bus Company, J & J Transportation, Efinger Sporting Goods, Metuchen Center, Passon's BSN/Sports, Triple Crown Sports), Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez (abstain- Durham School Services, Shore Vans, Villani Bus Company, J & J Transportation, Efinger Sporting Goods, Metuchen Center, Passon's BSN/Sports, Triple Crown Sports), Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Carvalho – 1

Negative: None

Supplemental Award of Contracts Report

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, that the report be accepted.

Mr. Rodriguez asked if the amended contract with New Classrooms Innovation Partners is the same as was in the Superintendent's Report.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer explained the expansion of the Teach to One: Math initiative.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Carvalho – 1

Negative: None

Miscellaneous Communication

None.

Claims List

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote (except for the claim for Candelario Trujillo which did not receive the required number of votes):

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Perreira (abstain- Candelario Trujillo), Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 5

Abstain: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Carvalho, Messrs. Neron, Rodriguez – 4

Negative: None

Resolution – Authorizing the Procurement of Goods and Services through State Agency for the 2014-2015 School Year

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Rodriguez, that the resolution be adopted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Carvalho – 1

Negative: None

Resolution – African-American Heritage Month

Mr. Trujillo read the resolution.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the resolution be adopted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Resolution – Career and Technical Education Month

Mrs. Carvalho read the resolution.

A motion was made by Mrs. Carvalho, seconded by Mr. Neron, that the resolution be adopted.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that we have a great career and technical high school here in the district that does fantastic technical and career training. Mr. Rodriguez stated that we are looking forward to expanding the program and these are students who can go directly into the workplace with accreditation and certificates that will earn them jobs that are paid above and much higher than minimum wage at livable wages.

Mr. Perreira stated that it is one of the most critical high schools that we have because as we all know not every student is generally geared toward that secondary education and going to college. Mr. Perreira stated that this school teaches them skills to be electricians, caregivers for children, hairdresser, and skills that they can use for gainful employment to be fruitful citizens. Mr. Perreira stated that it is one of the very important programs that we need to make sure that we always support and fund to keep it performing at the level it is now.

Mr. Trujillo stated that the technical school provides great opportunities as Mr. Perreira said to all of our children who seek a vocational education and highlights a lot of their skills. Mr. Trujillo stated that they have a great culinary program and we've partnered with Trinitas and have a great nursing program which is very popular and for years we have had a cosmetology program that has been very popular. Mr. Trujillo stated that he remembers early on when he first started to serve on the Board the auto body was closed for a while and with the Board's initiative at the time we were able to revive that program and it is viable now and is teaching young men and women to become mechanics and they do body work as well there. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is a great school with great opportunity and there is a mock supermarket where some of the children with special needs work. Mr. Trujillo stated that overall it is one of the schools that gets the least recognition but it is doing very important work. Mr. Trujillo urged his colleagues to visit the school and give the newly appointed principal support and let her know that we stand behind her and we are committed to the programs and the education at the vocational high school.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that career and technical education is very important to her and thanked Mrs. Amin for allowing her to read this.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Mr. Rodriguez thanked some elected officials for their commitment to public education and for taking time from their busy lives just like all of us including Union County Freeholder Sergio Granados, Council President Auguste-Perkins, Councilmen Manny Grova and Carlos Torres. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he was with two of his colleagues at a great basketball tournament organized by Mr. Taylor of School No. 9. Mr. Rodriguez stated that Mr. Monteiro, Mr. Perreira, and he played on the staff side and regardless of what goes on here we all come together for what we all hold dear, the students. Mr. Rodriguez congratulated Mr. Taylor for putting together this great event.

Resolution – Harriet Tubman

Ms. Bathelus read the resolution.

A motion was made by Ms. Bathelus, seconded by Mr. Trujillo, that the resolution be adopted.

Mr. Neron stated that he is excited that we as a school board make these resolutions and extremely excited to celebrate a trailblazer in the liberation of African people throughout the world. Mr. Neron stated that he encourages us as a district to continue pushing forward a curriculum of inclusion to educate our children so they understand the importance of their history. Mr. Neron stated that every month we recognize a different heritage and different nationalities and when it comes to African history month it is State mandated that we infuse a curriculum of inclusion in the school system through the Amistad Commission in the State. Mr. Neron encouraged his colleagues to support our Superintendent as we move forward implementing the Amistad regulations in our school district and making sure we implement a curriculum of inclusion here in the City which will help to uplift our youth, improve race relations, and improve relations among human beings and understand that we can be one family through understanding education and understanding each other's history. Mr. Neron stated that he doesn't want us to not take these resolutions lightly but to understand the meaning behind these resolutions and what it means to celebrate Harriet Tubman and what that meant to African people, African people around the world, people in general and what it means for us to be free and have a voice today and be able to be liberated, freedom of speech, learn, and read. Mr. Neron stated that at one point it was illegal for Africans here in this country to read and it was considered illegal for them to do things and be treated equal. Mr. Neron stated that we have come a very long way but have so far to go in continuing to educate our children. Mr. Neron commended the Board for making this resolution.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Resolution – Children's Dental Health Month

Mrs. Castillo-Ospina read the resolution.

A motion was made by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the resolution be adopted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Resolution – National School Counseling Week

Mr. Neron read the resolution.

A motion was made by Mr. Neron, seconded by Mr. Rodriguez, that the resolution be adopted.

Mr. Neron stated that he wants us to understand the importance of school counselors and social workers in our schools. Mr. Neron stated that when we talk about counseling we need to understand that our teachers and our administrators need counseling too because they have their hands full and they need somebody to talk to. Mr. Neron stated that he wants to emphasize to the district, the Superintendent, administrators, Board members, to understand that we need to support our teachers and administrators and our staff because they have a major load on their plate and they have a lot of burden to carry when they have to deal with so many of these socio-economic issues in our district. Mr. Neron stated that we look at the sad case at School No. 22 and our teachers need support and we need to be there to support them. Mr. Neron stated that counseling is a major element and he suggests that those at home and our children and our colleagues if you need the help for counseling to seek it because at the end of the day if you don't get the help that you need and the guidance that you need it may not be a good thing. Mr. Neron stated that it is important that we support National School Guidance Counselor Week.

Mr. Perreira stated that a guidance counselor is a very important job and they carry a very heavy load that we put on guidance counselors in our district and across the nation. Mr. Perreira stated that they have in their hands the job and task to make sure they are directing the children in the right path and to make sure they can achieve, graduate from high school and be ready to take on the college programs. Mr. Perreira thanked them because it is a very important job and he knows how stressful it is and they carry a heavy load with a lot of students, every day, every year. Mr. Perreira stated that if you have children make sure you know who the guidance counselor is and keep in constant contact because it is important for your child's success. Mr. Perreira thanked all the guidance counselors in the district for their hard work.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Mr. Rodriguez stated that he hopes we could do public participation next. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he doesn't know if anyone signed up or not but the nights are long and he hoped the people who came to speak would do so before we go into private session. Mr. Rodriguez urged the Board President to do public participation now because in the past he had to wait until 2:00 a.m. and it was unfair. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he hopes they can correct that and perhaps let the public speak now so they can go home to their families.

Mr. Monteiro thanked everyone here tonight for taking time out from all of their busy schedules to be here. Mr. Monteiro stated that it is an important part of our democracy and he certainly knows that we may not all agree on all issues all the time but it is important. Mr. Monteiro stated that it seems to be only on election or right after elections that people seem to come together and as the weeks and months go by less and less people attend meetings. Mr. Monteiro stated that he respectfully asks and encourages people to attend more meetings here, at City Council, at county government and to be informed and be involved.

Mr. Monteiro stated that as an Elizabeth Board of Education member he has the distinct opportunity to open schools, establish new exciting technology programs, help raise academic standards, and to be a part of this rich mosaic of individuals all over our City. Mr. Monteiro stated that he was born and raised in Elizabethport. Mr. Monteiro stated that Todd Bowles, the young man who is going to be the New York Jets Head Coach came into his mother's store almost every day. Mr. Monteiro stated that Todd was one year ahead of him attending Temple University and aside from being one of the most outstanding athletes he was one of the nicest guys he knew growing up in Elizabethport. Mr. Monteiro stated that was the kind of role model that they aspired to be and that they can be something from Elizabethport and we could be

anything that we set our minds and hearts to. Mr. Monteiro stated that the level of commitment to our schools exists in this community.

Mr. Monteiro stated that as a Board of Education member they do not earn a salary and many people think they do. Mr. Monteiro stated that they are rewarded with the smiles of countless children especially when you see them succeeding and aspiring to greater things. Mr. Monteiro stated that certainly this was a difficult two weeks for the Board of Education. Mr. Monteiro stated that he had submitted his letter to the Board of Education so that he can take some of the energy and apply it to other issues here in the City of Elizabeth like crime which is spiraling out of control and leadership is lacking to join people together. Mr. Monteiro stated that we know that the City may be divided and these elections are coming in within dozens of votes from each other and whether one group or another claims there is a majority it is clear that the City is divided. Mr. Monteiro stated that we need as individuals and as a City to listen more and talk less, argue less and hope more, believe more and doubt less, and more than anything we need to hate less and love more. Mr. Monteiro stated that he gives thanks to God and thanks to his mother and father every day. Mr. Monteiro stated that he lost his mother many years ago but she walks by his side and she instilled in himself and his two brothers a great deal of that. Mr. Monteiro stated that growing up as children of immigrants and growing up in Elizabethport many of you have heard his story of little Miguel, his brother, who aspired and became a pilot and today is a Captain flying a \$300 million plane. Mr. Monteiro stated that was all because of the love of his mother and father and incredible teachers who believed in his brothers and himself. Mr. Monteiro stated that he set off on this journey to involve himself in public life and became a councilman in 1994 for the first time with his colleague Manny Grova who he grew up with and they both ran and won at the same time. Mr. Monteiro stated that here were two kids from Elizabethport who went on to make a difference here in the City of Elizabeth both in the professions we are in and also in public life. Mr. Monteiro stated that he never set out for it to be a career and people say you're going to wreck your political career by opposing the Mayor or standing up to the Senator or standing up to the Board members. Mr. Monteiro stated that he never understood that because politics was never his career and fortunately he does well in business and he has aspired to do many things outside of the world of politics and public service. Mr. Monteiro stated that it is a love and a passion and many of us along the way seem to forget that. Mr. Monteiro stated that the Board President had a very, very difficult first meeting after swearing in and his heart went out to her because that first meeting should have been a meeting of ceremony, joy, and family. Mr. Monteiro stated that was their night for the newly elected Board members and they were elected and sworn in and it should have been a night of celebration. Mr. Monteiro stated that it turned out to be a night that he hopes many of us can live to forget because it was vile, offensive things were said, and people were disruptive and it is sad because together we are all one community. Mr. Monteiro stated that his heart went out to the Board President when she stood for her convictions and stood for her principles and he knows how hard that is. Mr. Monteiro stated that she told him she had never received so many phone calls, text messages, and emails from so many people and asked him if he had ever received those and he did. Mr. Monteiro stated that his first term as councilman was pretty uneventful and he worked hard with his community in the Fifth Ward. Mr. Monteiro stated that then he differed with the Mayor on policy and on many issues and that is our democracy. Mr. Monteiro stated that we may all be on the same party line, Democratic line, but we differ. Mr. Monteiro stated that unfortunately in the system then he wasn't allowed to differ. Mr. Monteiro stated that someone on the Board asked him if the most difficult time in his political life was when he was removed from a City Council Chamber by the City Council President at the time who asked to silence him because he was speaking out on the budget. Mr. Monteiro stated that he had no malice and no hate toward the Council President that night and he has let it go a long time ago. Mr. Monteiro stated that he holds no hate and no malice toward anyone. Mr. Monteiro stated that the Council President that night believed she was doing what she had to do or was told to do. Mr. Monteiro stated that he was doing what he knew he had to do. Mr. Monteiro stated that wasn't the hardest or most difficult political event in his life. Mr. Monteiro stated that what was harder than that was that his oldest brother was a municipal judge here in the City of Elizabeth. Mr. Monteiro stated that when in a City Council meeting he differed and didn't agree with something that was being voted on in

City Council he spoke out. Mr. Monteiro stated that he was told then by the administration at the time that if he continued to oppose the agenda or items on the Council that his brother would no longer be the judge. Mr. Monteiro stated that this was said to him one on one and couldn't be proven because we know how it works and no he didn't have a tape recording. Mr. Monteiro stated that what was the most difficult event of his life was having to go see his older brother and had to say to him that this is going to kill him but there is something on the City Council that he doesn't agree with and he really doesn't want to vote for it but he was told that if he doesn't vote for it his older brother would no longer be reappointed as a judge. Mr. Monteiro stated that his older brother does not have a political bone in his body and is the most apolitical person you will ever meet. Mr. Monteiro stated that his brother was loved by both law enforcement and the legal community and treated everyone with decency and fairness just like mom and dad would have wanted us to do. Mr. Monteiro stated that he said that to his brother and his brother said to him you do what is right and you do what you were elected to do. Mr. Monteiro stated that he expected that from his brother but what came next was the hardest thing he has ever done. Mr. Monteiro stated that he had to go see his mom and dad and told them that there was something on City Council that is coming up and he doesn't agree with and he is torn about it. Mr. Monteiro stated that you would think that your parents would say don't make noise son, go along with everything, you're going to wreck your political career, you're going to screw up your brother's judgeship but something happened that day that he never expected or imagined. Mr. Monteiro stated that his father who doesn't have schooling and who came to this country as an immigrant said to him son don't do it, don't do it for me and mom, and don't even do it for yourself, do it for those young men who died on the beaches of France, Afghanistan, and Iraq and do it for those young men who aren't coming home and did it for you. Mr. Monteiro stated that was a life changing moment because he never expected that from his mom and dad. Mr. Monteiro stated that to do it for those kids who paid the ultimate sacrifice and are buried out there with the white crosses, eighteen year old kids who never got to do what we do and sit where you sit. Mr. Monteiro stated that we all do it for them and that is what makes our democracy work and that is what makes this a great country. Mr. Monteiro stated that don't ever let us forget that and don't ever let us forget that we are any more important than that. Mr. Monteiro stated that we are a community and we need to be one. Mr. Monteiro stated that the people in the City do not want us to be divided they want us to be together and we need to find that way. Mr. Monteiro stated that never ever let us forget why we are here. Mr. Monteiro thanked everyone here for that opportunity and he will never forget why he sits here. Mr. Monteiro stated that whether he is here or whether he is there with all of you he will never be silenced because he will always remember those young men that are over there. Mr. Monteiro thanked everyone and thanked his colleagues.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that she had the privilege to go to Halsey and Dwyer high schools. Mrs. Carvalho stated that the Key Club is holding a blood drive and she gave blood today. Mrs. Carvalho urged her colleagues to support the Key Club. Mrs. Carvalho urged the public to also go out there and it is about our children and moving forward.

Ms. Bathelus recognized Councilman Frank Cuesta for being here and thanked him for his support.

Mr. Trujillo recognized former Board members Anita Duran, Carole Cascio, Rafael Fajardo, and Armando DaSilva who have taken their time to come here. Mr. Trujillo thanked the teachers, administrators, custodial staff, secretaries, security guards, kitchen personnel, and everyone in between for coming here tonight and attending this meeting. Mr. Trujillo stated that they have been the subject of many conversations on this Board and the way you have been treated has been the center of that conversation. Mr. Trujillo stated that he can tell you that he will continue to support each and every one of you and he understands the school place is a special place and special people take on the vocation to work in schools. Mr. Trujillo stated that in order to work in our schools you have to be tolerant and have lots of love and energy for our children. Mr. Trujillo stated that as a father of two children he entrusts the staff of the school system every day with his most precious thing God has ever blessed him with, his children. Mr.

Trujillo stated that every day he leaves his children there and he knows that the people that are in that building will love them, nurture them, and when they return home they will be better people. Mr. Trujillo stated that he will continue to support the staff and he will continue to support that they get paid well, work in a clean environment, safe environment, that they not be bullied or pushed around, and that they be respected, admired and loved as well. Mr. Trujillo stated that he stands by them as he has since he was first elected in 2007 and he will continue to support them and stand by them. Mr. Trujillo stated that they will not always agree with everything that he decides to do here but he can tell you in all honesty that he does it with a sincere heart and love for the City, schools, and children. Mr. Trujillo stated that he always welcomes everyone and this Board has always been accessible and we've prided ourselves on being an accessible Board beholden to the public. Mr. Trujillo stated that whether you vote or not, whether you have the ability to vote, the right to vote or not, if you have children in our schools, if you live within our City boundaries, and if you are a member of this City, we are your Board and we are here to represent you and to do what is right for you. Mr. Trujillo told the public to please do not hesitate to call us out on that. Mr. Trujillo stated that there were several resolutions that passed tonight and two in particular that teach us about tolerance and multiculturalism and how far we have come as a nation to tolerate others and our differences. Mr. Trujillo stated that at the swearing in there were a lot of things that were said and he is pleased to see tonight that there is a more reconcilable tone to this meeting and more of a normalcy to what happens here. Mr. Trujillo stated that this is a public institution but does not mean that we cannot run it professionally and with respect for the public and for each other. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is important that going forward we do respect each other's opinions and our differences. Mr. Trujillo stated that Mr. Monteiro spoke about his upbringing. Mr. Trujillo stated that he is the immigrant son of two Cuban-Americans who came to this country and left everything so he could be here. Mr. Trujillo stated that he is forever grateful for that and every day he gives thanks for that. Mr. Trujillo stated that his father just turned eighty and he gave him the passion he has to be here. Mr. Trujillo stated that his father was not afraid of Fidel Castro and his regime. Mr. Trujillo stated that he will not be silenced. Mr. Trujillo stated that his father sacrificed everything for this opportunity. Mr. Trujillo stated that he finds it absurd and offensive when he hears the Mayor of his City sit here and heckle, and he is not here today but he wishes he was and he would like to tell him to his face, that he sat here and heckled this meeting. Mr. Trujillo stated that the Mayor was picked up on an open microphone saying disparaging remarks about one of our members. Mr. Trujillo stated that is not American and we should not support that and he owes an apology to this Board. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have to be respectful of one another and our leaders need to show that respect. Mr. Trujillo stated that as the Mayor of this City for over twenty years he has never attended any of these Board meetings and he has never shown any interest in what we do here and to come here and practically try to incite misbehavior is really pathetic and sad. Mr. Trujillo stated that quite frankly it is embarrassing to all of us that the passion would get to the point where you just step all over each other and forget that we have mutual constituencies. Mr. Trujillo stated that there are people who vote for him and vote for me. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have to respect each other. Mr. Trujillo stated that he, too, has been removed from a City Council meeting simply because he wasn't going to stay quiet while they raised our property taxes. Mr. Trujillo stated that he owns a small, modest home with his wife in Elizabethport and it's not much of a home but it is his home. Mr. Trujillo stated that there he raised two children and his father was never able to buy a home. Mr. Trujillo stated that there has come a point where many residents in the City of Elizabeth cannot afford a home and the American dream that he is living is becoming further and further away from us. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have to be responsible and good stewards of the people's money. Mr. Trujillo stated that all he wanted to say at that City Council meeting was to please be honest with the citizens, stand up and do the right thing. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is their right to vote for a budget and he understands that but it is his right to oppose it and to use the police to remove him from that meeting is a slap in the face to all of those soldiers who have fought for the right for him to speak. Mr. Trujillo stated that he would not remove anyone from this meeting for speaking their mind and he would never move to use the police in that fashion. Mr. Trujillo stated that the police are here to protect and serve the public and that they are not the Gestapo and this is not Germany. Mr. Trujillo stated that for the

City Council President to make those disparaging remarks about Hispanics is very sad and to sit there and say she can't even speak English. Mr. Trujillo stated that some of us speak with an accent.

Mrs. Carvalho stated that this is absurd if you are removing someone from the public.

Mr. Trujillo stated that he does not want to have anyone removed. Mr. Trujillo stated that he would just like order and being respectful of everyone's opinion. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is his opinion that the Council President said what she said and she owes the Hispanic community of the City of Elizabeth an apology. Mr. Trujillo stated that you cannot come to this dais and preach to us that you are tolerant and that you expect all of us to be respectful. Mr. Trujillo stated that you cannot come here and say that you represent all of us. Mr. Trujillo stated that simply because we speak with an accent we have a right to be here, we've earned that right, and our soldiers, our children, our boys and girls have died on those beaches and just as much we have shed and we have paid with treasure and blood to have the opportunity for us to be here. Mr. Trujillo stated that we demand to be respected and she should apologize to all of us. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is shameful that you call yourself City Council President and have the audacity to come here and insult. Mr. Trujillo stated that she owes us an apology. Mr. Trujillo stated that he has been very respectful of the Council President on many occasions and he doesn't agree with everything she does but he does respect her. Mr. Trujillo stated that for her to sit there and insult his community he will not sit here and tolerate it.

Mr. Neron asked if we could have public comments. Mr. Neron stated that the people have been here a very long time and we need to be respectful of them.

Mr. Rodriguez stated that we have a policy in place to ask the public to sign in a full hour before our scheduled time to speak. Mr. Rodriguez stated that he would like to make a motion to waive that policy for tonight and allow the public and any member of the public to speak within the same confines of 3 minutes, an hour, because we have a lot of passionate people today. Mr. Rodriguez stated that we love to compare here but City Council doesn't make anybody sign in there and he thinks that would be the most fair thing.

Mr. Trujillo stated that they only have you removed by the police if they don't agree with you and that is the difference.

Mr. Rodriguez made a motion to waive the sign-in portion of the policy.

Mrs. Amin stated that she was not going to recognize the motion and allowed the City Council President to speak for three minutes.

Ms. Auguste-Perkins made disparaging comments about a Board member.

Mr. Monteiro stated that we have a decorum and do not allow the public speakers to call names.

Mrs. Amin asked Council President to be respectful of everyone.

Ms. Auguste-Perkins made disrespectful comments about a Board member.

Mrs. Amin stated that we are going to continue with the public participation.

Board President Amin presented the following public participation statement.

"At this time, the microphones are open for public comment to those who have signed in prior to this session. I shall call individuals to the microphones based on the order of the sign-in. Each statement made by a participant shall be limited to three minutes in duration. The total time

of public comment shall be limited to sixty minutes. No individual is able to yield their time to another individual. All statements shall be directed to the presiding officer; no participant may address or question Board members individually. The following rules for public participants shall apply: time limits will be strictly enforced, no personal attacks on individuals, no vulgar or indecent language, a person may address the Board no more than once during a single meeting, speakers should refrain from naming individuals, and comments or questions posed during public participation will not be debated. As a reminder, this is a meeting of the Board in public, not a meeting of the public.”

Mrs. Amin called upon the first public participant, Marcella Perrotti, to address the Board.

Marcella Perrotti, 511 West End Avenue, made disparaging comments about a Board member.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Michele Kidwell, to address the Board.

Michele Kidwell, 523 Burnham Road, spoke about the election results and it was confusing to her.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Maria Lorenz, to address the Board.

Maria Lorenz, 103 Murray Street, spoke about special education issues.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Ernestine Smith, to address the Board.

Ernestine Smith, 76 Westfield Avenue, spoke about transportation issues and stated that she is ashamed of the Board of Education.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Maria Echavarria, to address the Board.

Maria Echavarria, 321 Westfield Avenue, spoke about her daughter and special education issues.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Pia Carbajal, to address the Board.

Pia Carbajal, 19 DeHart Place, thanked the Board of Education for the services for her daughter and stated that the nurses do a good job at the school. Mrs. Carbajal spoke about the shame of what is happening tonight and they should think about the children here tonight. Mrs. Carbajal stated that it does not matter what color we are and we are here for our children.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, James Carey, to address the Board.

James Carey, 212 Inslee Place, spoke about issues during the campaign.

Mrs. Amin thanked him for his comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Jeanette Gilbert, to address the Board.

Jeanette Gilbert, 225 Second Street, stated that she is a member of the Elizabeth Education Organizing Committee, EEOC, and spoke about issues during a previous meeting, the time for sign in for public speaking, and that the performances of children should be on a different night.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments and called upon the next public participant, Christina Morera, to address the Board.

Christina Morera, 805 Gebhardt Avenue, stated that she is here to represent the parents who are choosing not to have their children take the PARCC test.

Mrs. Amin thanked her for her comments. Mrs. Amin called upon the next public participant, Rafael Fajardo, to address the Board.

Rafael Fajardo, 400 Madison Avenue, spoke about everybody sitting on the Board of Education voting their conscience and congratulated the Board President for voting her conscience.

Mrs. Amin thanked him for his comments. Since there were no other citizens signed in to address the Board, Mrs. Amin declared this portion of the public meeting closed.

The President requests a motion to go into Private Session to consider matters exempt under the Open Public Meetings Act, specifically for discussion of personnel, specifically, G.S. and L.R.; and Harassment, Intimidation, and Bullying results. The Board will reconvene in public to take formal action.

A motion was made by Mr. Monteiro, seconded by Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, to go into private session at 10:05 p.m.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

The Board reconvened in public at 11:10 p.m. to continue with the meeting and take formal action.

Superintendent's Report – Harassment, Intimidation, and Bullying (HIB) Investigative Results

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Rodriguez, that the report be accepted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Resolution – Administrative Leave without pay effective January 17, 2015 through June 30, 2015 – L.R.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the resolution be adopted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Resolution – Return to Work effective January 22, 2015 – G.S.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, that the resolution be adopted.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo – 8

Abstain: Mrs. Amin – 1

Negative: None

Superintendent of Schools Olga Hugelmeyer stated that tonight there will be a presentation concerning the Anti-Bullying Bill of Rights Act School Self-Assessment and introduced Anti-Bullying Coordinator Peter Vosseler to present the HIB Grading Presentation.

Mr. Peter Vosseler, Anti-Bullying Coordinator, stated that we are here for a presentation introducing the scores the Department of Education assigned to our district and at the same time to all the other districts in the State of New Jersey. Mr. Vosseler stated that this public session meets the requirement in the law that we present it in public.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the grades are based on the self-assessment completed by each school last year, the Board approved the results and they were input into the Department of Education website and sent to the State which reviewed and affirmed the results and on December 16, 2014 they sent the results back to the schools stating that all of our schools' results were kept the same. Mr. Vosseler stated that our district went from a grade of 45.21 two school years ago to 51.32. for the 2013-2014 school year which is a 14% improvement.

Mr. Vosseler stated that once the State affirms the results we are required by law at the next regularly scheduled public meeting to re-present the results that were presented in the Fall. Mr. Vosseler stated that a rubric was developed by the State to aid districts in assessing the schools' efforts and improving their Anti-Bullying Rights programs. Mr. Vosseler stated that the rubric was designed to be a growth model. Mr. Vosseler stated that two years ago it was brand new and after the schools reported their results we are looking towards now boosting the grades higher year over year as we have done this past year.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the rubric consists of eight core elements and twenty-six indicators with each indicator having a score of zero to three points and explained that zero is for not meeting the requirements, 1 is for partially meeting the requirements, 2 is for meeting all the requirements, and 3 is for exceeding the requirements.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the first element is programs, approaches, initiatives which includes that the school annually establishes HIB programs, approaches and initiatives; the school annually implements and documents HIB programs, approaches, or other initiatives; the school annually assesses HIB programs, approaches or other initiatives; the school's HIB programs, approaches or other initiatives are designed to create school-wide conditions to prevent and address HIB; and the school safety team (SST) has identified patterns of HIB and reviewed school climate and school policies for the prevention of HIB.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the second element is training on the HIB policy and that school employees, contracted service providers and volunteers are provided training on the HIB policy; the HIB policy training includes instruction on preventing HIB on the basis of protected categories enumerated in the ABR and other distinguishing characteristics that may incite incidents of discrimination or HIB; and the HIB policy was discussed with students, in accordance with the district's process for these discussions.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the third element is other staff instruction and training programs which includes that each teaching staff member completed at least two hours of instruction in suicide prevention that included information on HIB in each five-year professional development period; each teaching staff member completed at least two hours of instruction on HIB prevention in each five-year professional development period; the school anti-bullying specialist (ABS) was given time during the usual school schedule to participate in in-service training in preparation to act as the ABS; members of the school safety team were provided with professional development in effective practices of successful school climate programs or approaches; and school leaders

have received information of the prevention of harassment, intimidation, and bullying as part of their training on issues of school ethics, school law, and school governance.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the fourth element is curriculum and instruction on HIB and related information and skills including that the school provided ongoing age-appropriate instruction on preventing HIB in accordance with the Core Curriculum Content Standards and the school observed the Week of Respect during the week beginning with the first Monday in October each year recognizing the importance of character education by providing age-appropriate instruction focusing on HIB prevention.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the fifth element is HIB personnel and that the principal appoints the school anti-bullying specialist (ABS); the ABS met at least two times per school year with the district anti-bullying coordinator (ABC); and the school safety team (SST) met at least two times per school year. Mr. Vosseler stated that even though the law requires two times they meet at least five times each year because of all the work they have.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the sixth element is the school level incident reporting procedure and includes that the school implemented the district's procedure for reporting HIB that includes all required elements; and the school implemented the district's procedure for reporting new information on a prior HIB report. Mr. Vosseler stated that the district uses the HIBster reporting system which is a very efficient and effective way to report incidents to thoroughly investigate them and determine what interventions, actions, and consequences are necessary for each case. Mr. Vosseler stated that it is also used for new information if it becomes available then they can reopen the case.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the seventh element is the HIB investigation procedure that the school followed the Board of Education approved policy on HIB investigations procedures which provides for notification to parents of alleged offenders and alleged victims in each reported HIB incident, completion of the investigation within ten school days of the written incident report, preparation of a written report on the findings of each HIB investigation, and results of the investigation reported to the chief school administrator within two school days of completion of the investigation.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the last element is HIB reporting which includes that the school has a procedure for ensuring that staff member reports (verbal and written) include the required information for all incidents of violence, vandalism, and HIB; and the district posts all HIB assessment scores on their website. Mr. Vosseler stated that on each school's website we have posted the individual school scores and the scores for all the schools are on our district home page.

Mr. Vosseler stated that each indicator has a score of zero to three points and explained that zero is for not meeting the requirements, 1 is for partially meeting the requirements, 2 is for meeting all the requirements, and 3 is for exceeding the requirements. Mr. Vosseler stated that the highest possible score is 78 which means that everything is perfect. Mr. Vosseler stated that no one is perfect and we would like all of our schools to have a score of 50 which indicates that we are meeting all the requirements. Mr. Vosseler stated that this year the schools ranged from 44 to 60 and 25 out of our 34 schools scored a 50 or more which is a great improvement from the previous year. Mr. Vosseler stated that the average score across all schools was 51.32 which means on average throughout the district we are meeting our requirements.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the self-assessment process requirements are that we complete the assessment led by the school safety team (SST) and the anti-bullying specialist (ABS) in each school, information is sent to the anti-bullying coordinator (ABC) and input into the NJDOE website. Mr. Vosseler stated that the anti-bullying coordinator presents the results to the public in the Fall, obtains approval from the Board of Education with assurances from the Superintendent, and then submits the self-assessments to NJDOE. Mr. Vosseler stated that the NJDOE approved every school and grade without any changes.

Mr. Vosseler stated that the highlights of our work to date include an annual Week of Respect, students attended the Liberty Basketball Anti-Bullying Day, ongoing district training for our team members at the district level and school level, State training for the Anti-Bullying Coordinator, and a wide variety of guest speakers who address different aspects of anti-bullying at the schools. Mr. Vosseler stated that the work ahead of us is to analyze self-assessments by

school and that we have been analyzing the data from the schools since last year. Mr. Vosseler stated that he is focusing on the nine schools that scored below the assessment grade of 50 and helping them to work with the administration, anti-bullying specialist, guidance counselors, and school workers to boost their grade and show improvement. Mr. Vosseler asked if there were any questions and if there was anyone who would like to comment on tonight's report.

Mrs. Amin thanked Mr. Vosseler for the report.

Mr. Trujillo stated that he noticed when the chart was shown for the assessment scores several of the high schools were under 50. Mr. Trujillo asked if there is a reason why we are having trouble reaching above 50 at the high school level.

Mr. Vosseler stated that is going to be his focus moving forward. Mr. Vosseler stated that he has to analyze why that is by going through the specific indicators as to where they scored lower and he will work with them.

Mr. Trujillo asked the Superintendent if Mr. Vosseler could come back three months from now and give us more information and report if there are trends especially at the high schools.

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, to accept the Anti-Bullying Results.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

Superintendent of Schools Olga Hugelmeyer welcomed everyone to the Public Hearing on Harassment, Intimidation and Bullying (HIB) for the period starting July 1, 2014 and ending December 31, 2014. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that in January 2011 the Anti-Bullying Bill of Rights was signed into law as P.L. 2010, Chapter 122 and in accordance with this law all New Jersey public school districts must designate the first full week of October of each year as a "Week of Respect" and during the Week of Respect school districts are expected to organize activities including, but not limited to, age-appropriate instruction and opportunities for student discussion on conflict resolution, issues of diversity, and tolerance. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that a resolution was put before the Board in October declaring the week of October 6-10, 2014 Week of Respect and each of our schools planned appropriate activities for this week.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that in fulfilling the reporting requirements pursuant to N.J.S.A. 18A:17-46 two times each year between September 1 and July 1 and between July 1 and December 31, the school board shall hold a public hearing at which the Chief School Administrator will report to the Board of Education and the public any acts of harassment, intimidation and bullying which occurred during the reporting period. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that from July 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014 there were 100 HIB investigations completed by appropriate school staff and of those cases investigated 32 were confirmed cases of HIB and were affirmed by board members through the December 2014 meeting. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that the following Anti-Bullying Specialists, Anti-Bullying Specialist Alternates, and Anti-Bullying Coordinator conducted these investigations including Ann Schpakow, Maria Brito, Jessica Sofranko, Ali Abdul-Malik, Kerry O'Connor, Maria Vincas, Peter Vosseler, Lourdes Soto, Linda Fletcher, Colleen Reynolds, Christine Lillis-Flaherty, Sarah LaFace, Nancy Nieves, Denise Uniacke, Sofia Verma, Theresa Guevara, Natalie Haiken, Dayna Gil-Morais, Darnella Boles, Andrea Giuca, Lauren Czarnecki, Cindy Lichtenstein, Amelia Joanne Turner, Rosa Dulzaides, Aleina Cuza-Murray, Linda Lewis, Guadalupe Ferreiro, Margaret Lundrigan, Natasha Morrissey, Antonio Sapio, Favi Ramos, Lisa Baginski-Matlosz, Christine Rappa, Maria Cabrera, Jason Colcol, Giselle Sanzone, Joseph Sanchez, Linda Bean, Sam Bernstein, Megan Marx, and Eunice Coucelo.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that there were 6 incidents based on race, 0 incidents based on color, 0 incident based on religion, 1 incidents based on ancestry, 6 incidents based on national origin, 1 incidents based on gender, 5 incidents based on sexual orientation, 0 incidents based on gender identity or expression, 4 incidents based on mental, physical or sensory disability, and 27 incidents based on other targeted bases. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that 0 incidents involved a gesture, 0 incidents involved a written communication, 30 incidents were verbal, 12 incidents were physical, and 3 incidents involved an electronic communication. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that there were 14 out-of-school suspensions, 9 in-school detentions, and 20 other disciplinary actions. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that additional services such as in-house counseling, skill development, and behavioral intervention were offered to involved students. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that between July 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014 the district provided appropriate HIB training to guidance counselors and social workers and to new staff and support staff in the district and additionally, the district provided extensive and specified training to the Anti-Bullying Coordinator and to all Anti-Bullying Specialists and Alternates. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that non-certificated staff also received training. Mrs. Hugelmeyer stated that all school level administrators and all HIB staff received training in the HIBster reporting program which was implemented this school year.

Mrs. Hugelmeyer asked if there is anyone who would like to comment on tonight's report. Since no dialogue transpired and no comments were made regarding the Chief School Administrator's presentation on harassment, intimidation and bullying, Mrs. Hugelmeyer closed the public hearing.

Mrs. Amin thanked Mrs. Hugelmeyer for the report. Mrs. Amin asked if there was any old business to discuss. Since there was no old business to discuss Mrs. Amin asked if there was any new business to discuss.

Mr. Monteiro stated that there was an editorial in the Star Ledger yesterday, *Urban N.J. School Districts Should Follow Elizabeth's Example*. Mr. Monteiro read the editorial written by William Daley, "New Jersey's former Abbott school districts are known for high costs and low results. Some of the biggest districts like Newark and Jersey City have been controlled for a long time by state administrators. Many of the districts have also opened charter schools, which just adds to the expense since it seems none of the failing public schools are ever shut down. But if you drive through Elizabeth, each of the school buildings has a big banner proudly proclaiming that they are ranked New Jersey's number one urban school district. The schools appear to be in good repair and you get the impression that things are under control. It raises the question of what can we learn from New Jersey's highest achieving urban school district. It seems to me that the state administrators should be studying what the Elizabeth Board of Education is doing right and try to implement those concepts in the other former Abbott districts."

Mr. Monteiro stated that it is a praise to all of our wonderful administrators, Superintendent, assistant superintendents, and all of our staff who work day in and day out, our custodians, security guards, food services, secretaries, and we just can't say enough and we thank them. Mr. Monteiro stated that every so often we see a little bit of the praise and sunshine and we all know we are doing the right thing.

On a motion by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Perreira, the meeting was adjourned at 11:40 p.m.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mmes. Carvalho, Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Monteiro, Neron, Perreira, Rodriguez, Trujillo, Mrs. Amin – 9

Negative: None

School Business Administrator/Board Secretary